



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                          |                                                                                                                       |
|--------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">Asian Journal of Environment &amp; Ecology</a>                                                            |
| Manuscript Number:       | Ms_AJEE_32899                                                                                                         |
| Title of the Manuscript: | FEEDING ECOLOGY OF PRIMATES IN SOUTHERN SECTOR OF GASHAKA-GUMTI NATIONAL PARK (FILINGA RANGE), TARABA STATE, NIGERIA. |
| Type of the Article      | Original Research Article                                                                                             |

**General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|                                     | Reviewer's comment                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments | <p>Abstract<br/>Scientific names should be placed in italics. Inappropriate use of 'respectively' in sentences, please revise. Abstract is a concise summary of the whole study and should include miniature versions of all parts of the study including conclusions and recommendations. Also the problem statement is not clear or absent.</p> <p>Introduction<br/>There is no clear problem statement or rational for conducting the study at GGNP. Please provide a clear basis for conducting the study at the GGNP.</p> <p>Line 7<br/>Sentence is unclear, please revise.</p> <p>Line 10<br/>All trails</p> <p>Line 89<br/>The objective is too broad. This is more of an aim. The following sentence (Line 92) can then form the objective.</p> <p>Line 105<br/>There are updates indicating that <i>Cercopithecus mona</i> is now <i>Cercopithecus lowei</i>. I am not very sure but please check on its validity.</p> <p>Line 106<br/>Guinea fowl (<i>Numida meleagris</i>)<br/>Monitor lizards (<i>Varanus niloticus</i>)</p> <p>Line 110<br/>Please provide a clearer map of the study area (Figure 1) indicating</p> | <p>Okey, i agree with the reviewer for the observation on my Abstract. Correction will be made.</p> <p>Line 105<br/>They are different species just that they belong to the same geo-species <i>Cercopithecus mona</i> /<i>Cercopithecus lowei</i>.</p> <p>For figure 1: the map of the study area to me is okey because ais a general overview and the site has been indicated alongside the route walked on, also the coordinate of the trials were indicated as well.</p> <p>Line 147: Table 1 shows the primate species sample and the feeding behaviour while Table 2 indicate the total number of plant species feed on by the species sampled, i believe is not misleading.</p> <p>All other suggestions were inserted in the body of the work as suggested.</p> <p>Thanks.</p> |



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |  |
|--|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|  | <p>positions of the transects and areas surveyed for clarity of methods.</p> <p>Line 125<br/>The trails were walked in the morning 06.00h – 11.00h</p> <p>Line 127<br/>Authors should state the types of behaviour they expected to record and their relevance in behavioural studies.</p> <p>Line 129<br/>Please indicate the type of rainforest</p> <p>Line 130<br/>Materials used for data collection were; a Global Positioning System (Garmin GPSMAP 78S) for taking coordinates of the study sites and primate locations, a digital camera (Sony cyber shot DSC-HX200V) for taking pictures and a pair of binoculars (Crown field 7.5*) for viewing and identification of species.</p> <p>Line 142/143<br/>Five species of primates were identified during the survey. Relative abundances of the different primate species are shown in Figure 2.</p> <p>Line 143/144<br/>Please provide scientific names for all common names</p> <p>Line 147<br/>Sentence is unclear and misleading. Table 1 does not show the presence of primate species in the southern sector of GGNP. All the parameters used to assess feeding behaviour are obvious and does not promote knowledge significantly. Monkeys are social animals and live mainly on trees, hence it is expected that all the monkeys investigated will feed in groups and on trees. No new knowledge has been produced in Table 2.</p> <p>Line 172<br/>Y-axis label of Figure 2 and 3 should be changed to read 'relative abundance (%)'. Captions for Figure 2 and 3 should be standardized.</p> |  |
|--|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|



**SDI Review Form 1.6**

|                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                |
|-----------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------|
|                                         | <p>Line 179<br/>The use of feeding activity and feeding behaviour interchangeably in Table 2. Reconsider use of one term that appropriately fits data collected.</p> <p>Line 186<br/><i>Annona senegalensis</i><br/><i>Parinari excelsa</i></p> <p>Line 220<br/>There is no evidence for this statement – one year or more. Several chimpanzee surveys have been done under 1 year. Please provide a reference for the statement.</p> <p>Line 224<br/>Please update Table 2 to include ground/terrestrial feeding by baboons and tantalus monkeys.</p> <p>Conclusions<br/>Authors should limit their conclusions to study findings. For example, did the study reveal a risk of food falling below the carrying capacity of the area? This aspect will rather be captured in the recommended studies. Also, the authors should clearly demonstrate the importance of the study in terms of primate sustenance.</p> |                |
| <b><u>Minor</u></b> REVISION comments   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                |
| <b><u>Optional/General</u></b> comments | A lot of unclear sentences. Authors should read through the manuscript carefully and remove redundant sentences.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   | Noted, i agree |